A GUIDE TO PEER REVIEW PROCESS

A SAMPLE PAPER ON THE ROLE OF GUIDANCE & COUNSELLING IN STUDENTS' CAREER CHOICE

BY

ANTHONY M. WANJOHI

NAIROBI, 2011

Table of Contents

Table of Contents ii

PART I

FINAL REVIEWED DRAFT 1

PART II

PEER REVIEWED DRAFT WITH COMMENTS 9

PART III

PEER REVIEW FEEDBACK SHEET 15

PART IV

ARGUMENT WORKSHEET 16

PART V

THE SIGNED ARGUMENT PLANNING SHEET 17

PART I

FINAL REVIEWED DRAFT

Introduction

The history of school counseling formally started at the turn of the twentieth century, although a case can be made for tracing the foundations of counseling and guidance principles to ancient Greece and Rome with the philosophical teachings of Plato and Aristotle. There is also evidence to argue that some of the techniques and skills of modern-day guidance counselors were practiced by Catholic priests in the Middle Ages, as can be seen by the dedication to the concept of confidentiality within the confessional. The factors leading to the development of guidance and counseling in the United States schools began after its entry into World War I, which brought the need for assessment of large groups of draftees, in large part to select appropriate people for leadership positions. These early psychological assessments performed on large groups of people were quickly identified as being valuable tools to be used in the educational system, thus beginning the standardized testing movement that in the early twenty-first century is still a strong aspect of U.S. public education. In 1913 the National Vocational Guidance Association was formed and helped legitimize and increase the number of guidance counselors. Early vocational guidance counselors were often teachers appointed to assume the extra duties of the position in addition to their regular teaching responsibilities (Krumboltz and Koplin, 2002). Virtually all countries have established channels to intensify and improve guidance and counseling methods and materials in their learning institutions. Poignant examples include: Israel, Japan, Turkey and Hong Kong.

According to Watanabe-Muraoka, Senzaki, and Herr (2001) in Japan, the goal of high school counseling is to "help every student develop abilities of self-understanding, decision-making, life

planning, and action-taking to be able to adjust in the career options he or she decides to pursue". In Israel, school counselors devote one-third of their time to classroom instruction and the rest to personal and social counseling. Career counseling is somewhat curtailed because students are required to enlist with the armed services after high school. In Hong Kong, school counseling and guidance is becoming more of a service that is incorporated into the whole school with an emphasis on prevention. Turkey has a fifty-year history of counseling development. There is a professional association that publishes a journal and sponsors conferences. Many secondary schools have counseling services and receive support from the Ministry of National Education.

In Kenya, guidance and counseling is an initiative that is aimed at providing career information and skills to impart life-skills to students. Muriithi (2007) observes that life skills offered by these initiatives empower people to use their functional skills and knowledge in the workplace. Additionally, life skills enable people with business acumen to apply their skills and exploit opportunities. Life skills include leadership, communication, confidence, integrity, focus, discipline and perseverance. However, the key barrier to the smooth progress of this initiative is lack of support of students' discussions on career guidance with teachers by the administration. In any case, they have subjects to teach and less time to spend on career guidance. This shortcoming led to design of a course for career guidance teachers. To date, the course has been piloted in four workshops attended by 120 teachers in Laikipia. The next step is to hold a workshop for head-teachers and education officers to seek their support to resource the initiative. The pilot has generated overwhelming interest among students, teachers and parents.

Statement of the Problem

Increasing complexities of modern life have placed new responsibilities on youngsters. They need skills and competencies, which were not required in the relatively simple society of yesteryear. The skills and competencies they need relate to the mastering of information available and skills of seeking out adequate information needed to progress in their chosen careers. Developing these skills among students require new capabilities among teachers so that they may provide guidance and counseling to them. In the local perspective, for instance, students are receiving little to no career guidance outside home and are not pursuing the appropriate educational plan for real world career opportunities. On the other hand a number of studies have been fielded on guidance and counseling. A survey by Modern Machine Shop (MMS) (2002) intended to examine career guidance among high school students in the US. A study on Guidance & Counseling, a case of Vidyalaya Guidance committee by Kiran (2006) intended to focus on guidance and counseling as a process of education that starts from the birth of the child. Another study by Watanabe-Muraoka, Mieko; Senzaki and Herr (2000) focused on Contribution of Career Guidance and Counseling in schools in Israel, Japan, Turkey and Hong Kong. However in all the studies conducted, there is no single one of them that has reviewed on role of guidance and counseling in students' career choice. Most of studies tended to be rather general, approaching the theme of counseling in a broader perspective.

Empirical Review

A survey by Modern Machine Shop (MMS) (2002) investigated the challenges facing career guidance among High School Students. More than half of the students surveyed (51 percent) could not identify someone in high school who has been a mentor or especially helpful in

advising them on career or job options. The vast majority (78 percent) credited their parents as their top adult influence, but the amount of time spent discussing careers was minimal (3 hours or less in the past few months), even at home. Therefore the study concluded that high school students are making critical decisions about their career paths in a vacuum, unaware of the broad array of educational and employment opportunities available to them.

Kiran (2006) conducted a study on Guidance and Counseling with regard to Vidyalaya Guidance Committee. The study aimed to focus on guidance and counseling as a process of education that starts from the birth of the child. Among the key establishments of the study were the fact that guidance is a process of dynamic interpersonal relationship designed to influence the attitude and subsequent behavior of the person and counseling entails advice-giving and psychoanalysis procedures. Guidance and Counseling were found to go hand in hand to facilitate the process of dynamic interpersonal relationship designed to influence the attitude and subsequent behavior of the person.

A study by Gysbers et al (2000) intended to determine the Major Trends, Issues, and Controversies in guidance and counseling. The main aspects determined were namely; Professional title: Some professionals in the field prefer to be called guidance counselor, while an increasing number prefer the term school counselor; Evaluation: A major trend in education is the demand for accountability and evaluation. School counselors have not been immune to this demand; School violence. School violence can range from bullying to gunfire. Counselors have training to assist teachers and students in cases of violence and to establish violence prevention programs. Terrorism: Terrorism is becoming an increasingly difficult problem in the world of the

early twenty-first century. Counselors are able to ascertain the extent to which a student or teacher may be adversely affected by terrorist acts.

Christie (2001) carried out a study on educational guidance and counseling in Alexandria, Egypt. The main objective of the study was to find out the importance of educational guidance and counseling in schools. The researcher maintained that counseling in secondary schools assists students to develop socially, emotionally and intellectual growth is given correct orientation. The study also sought to find out the objectives of counseling of students these objectives included the following: Students should achieve self understanding; Students should be able to deal with complicated interpersonal relationships; Students should be able to attain appropriate academic achievement; Students should be able to alternate special, personal or emotional problems and Students should be able to make appropriate educational and vocational decisions

Krumboltz, and Kolpin (2002) fielded a comparison of causes for Intensification of School Guidance and Counseling in the United States and Columbia. The study established that in the US support for school counseling was spurred specifically by the Soviet Union's launching of Sputnik and fears that other countries were outperforming the United States in the fields of mathematics and science. Hence, by providing appropriate funding for education, including guidance and counseling, it was thought that more students would find their way into the sciences. On the other hand guidance and counseling in Columbia was found have been prompted by the vast array of student problems - personal, academic, social, and career issues. Typically, these areas were found to be blended together when working with a student on any

one topic; hence, it was impossible to separate the duties of a counselor on the basis of a particular problem.

Eadaoin (2000) carried out a study on counseling in schools in Hong Kong. The main objective of the study was to find out the role of counseling in fourth grade schools. It was noted that counseling in schools helps improve academic achievement since students help each other academically, socially and even psychologically. The study was on the importance of counseling in schools. The contribution of the study is of significance in this study based on its findings on the role of counseling in academic achievement.

A study by Schmidt (2003) on professional school counseling in the United States pointed out the necessity to implement a comprehensive school counseling programme that promotes and enhances student achievement through a guidance curriculum, individual planning strategies, responsive services and comprehensive school counseling programme support/ advocacy. The study established that professional school counselors meet the needs of student in basic domains: academic development, career development and personal/social development knowledge, understanding counseling, coordination and collaboration. Classroom guidance lessons are designed to be preventive in nature and include self-management and self-monitoring skills.

Gilbert (1992) when comparing the school counseling profession in Kenya with other countries like the United States, counseling began as a vocational guidance movement at the beginning of the 20th century. In Kenya guidance and counseling started with the Ministry of Labour only to

give vocational counseling, which is similar to the United States. The only difference is that in the US, it was a movement while in Kenya it was only a department in the ministry of education. In the United States, professional school counselors implement a comprehensive school counseling programme that promotes and enhances student achievement through a guidance curriculum, individual planning strategies, responsive services and comprehensive school counseling programme support/ advocacy.

Muriithi (2007) conducted a study on Career Guidance and Entrepreneurship Development Initiative. The study aimed at aligning career guidance in secondary schools, colleges and universities to emerging market needs. This re-alignment was set to be attained by linking functional competence to life skills. Life skills improve employee effectiveness and entrepreneurship. The study also intended to provide information on careers to teachers/counselors to guide students in selecting marketable subjects-mix and careers and imparts life-skills that lead to fulfilling careers. This is because life skills provide the frame for applying knowledge to real-life situations. So far, the course has been piloted in four workshops attended by 120 teachers in Laikipia. The next step is to hold a workshop for head-teachers and education officers to seek their support to resource the initiative. The pilot has generated overwhelming interest among students, teachers and parents.

Knowledge Gap

A number of studies have been fielded on guidance and counseling. A survey by Modern Machine Shop (MMS) (2002) intended to examine career guidance among high school students in the US. A study on Guidance & Counseling, a case of Vidyalaya Guidance committee by Kiran (2006) intended to focus on guidance and counseling as a process of education that starts

from the birth of the child. Another study by Watanabe-Muraoka, Mieko; Senzaki and Herr (2000) focused on Contribution of Career Guidance and Counseling in schools in Israel, Japan, Turkey and Hong Kong. Christie (2001) carried out a study on educational guidance and counseling in Alexandria, Egypt. Eadaoin (2000) carried out a study on counseling in schools in Hong Kong. A study by Schmidt (2003) focused on professional school counseling in the United States. Muriithi (2007) conducted a study on Career Guidance and Entrepreneurship Development Initiative. However in all the studies conducted, there is none that has been carried out with the aim of establishing the role of guidance and counseling in students' career choice in a particular school.

PART II

PEER REVIEWED DRAFT WITH COMMENTS

Introduction

In Kenya, guidance and counseling is an initiative that is aimed at providing career information and skills to impart life-skills to students. Muriithi (2007) observes that life skills offered by these initiatives empower people to use their functional skills and knowledge in the workplace. Additionally, life skills enable people with business acumen to apply their skills and exploit opportunities. Life skills include leadership, communication, confidence, integrity, focus, discipline and perseverance. However, the key barrier to the smooth progress of this initiative is lack of support of students' discussions on career guidance with teachers by the administration. In any case, they have subjects to teach and less time to spend on career guidance. This shortcoming led to design of a course for career guidance teachers. To date, the course has been piloted in four workshops attended by 120 teachers in Laikipia. The next step is to hold a workshop for head-teachers and education officers to seek their support to resource the initiative. The pilot has generated overwhelming interest among students, teachers and parents.

Comment: *Introduce the role of guidance and counseling in career choice among students from international to local perspective. Show the genesis of the problem.* From broad to narrow perspective.

Statement of the Problem

Increasing complexities of modern life have placed new responsibilities on youngsters. They need skills and competencies, which were not required in the relatively simple society of yesteryear. The skills and competencies they need relate to the mastering of information available and skills of seeking out adequate information needed to progress in their chosen careers. Developing these skills among students require new capabilities among teachers so that

they may provide guidance and counseling to them. In the local perspective, for instance, students are receiving little to no career guidance outside home and are not pursuing the appropriate educational plan for real world career opportunities. Therefore, there is need to examine the role of guidance and counseling in helping students to make career choices.

Comment: *Bring out the problem more vividly. State the thesis problem based on the following – social need (how its is on the ground) and also based on knowledge gap (based on the inadequacy on the available body of literature).*

Empirical Review

A survey by Modern Machine Shop (MMS) (2002) investigated the challenges facing career guidance among High School Students. More than half of the students surveyed (51 percent) could not identify someone in high school who has been a mentor or especially helpful in advising them on career or job options. The vast majority (78 percent) credited their parents as their top adult influence, but the amount of time spent discussing careers was minimal (3 hours or less in the past few months), even at home. Therefore the study concluded that high school students are making critical decisions about their career paths in a vacuum, unaware of the broad array of educational and employment opportunities available to them.

Comment: *Grammar, consider revising*

Kiran (2006) conducted a study on Guidance and Counseling with regard to Vidyalaya Guidance Committee. The study aimed to focus on guidance and counseling as a process of education that starts from the birth of the child. Among the key establishments of the study were the fact that guidance is a process of dynamic interpersonal relationship designed to influence the attitude and subsequent behavior of the person and counseling entails advice-giving and psychoanalysis procedures. Guidance and Counseling were found to go hand in hand to facilitate the process of

dynamic interpersonal relationship designed to influence the attitude and subsequent behavior of the person.

Comment: *Link between the studies missing, no deduction made. Interact with the presented study. maintain your own voice.*

A study by Gysbers et al (2000) intended to determine the Major Trends, Issues, and Controversies in guidance and counseling. The main aspects determined were namely; Professional title: Some professionals in the field prefer to be called guidance counselor, while an increasing number prefer the term school counselor; Evaluation: A major trend in education is the demand for accountability and evaluation. School counselors have not been immune to this demand; School violence. School violence can range from bullying to gunfire. Counselors have training to assist teachers and students in cases of violence and to establish violence prevention programs. Terrorism: Terrorism is becoming an increasingly difficult problem in the world of the early twenty-first century. Counselors are able to ascertain the extent to which a student or teacher may be adversely affected by terrorist acts.

Christie (2001) carried out a study on educational guidance and counseling in Alexandria, Egypt. The main objective of the study was to find out the importance of educational guidance and counseling in schools. The researcher maintained that counseling in secondary schools assists students to develop socially, emotionally and intellectual growth is given correct orientation. The study also sought to find out the objectives of counseling of students these objectives included the following: Students should achieve self understanding; Students should be able to deal with complicated interpersonal relationships; Students should be able to attain appropriate academic achievement; Students should be able to alternate special, personal or emotional

problems and Students should be able to make appropriate educational and vocational decisions

Krumboltz, and Kolpin (2002) fielded a comparison of causes for Intensification of School Guidance and Counseling in the United States and Columbia. The study established that in the US support for school counseling was spurred specifically by the Soviet Union's launching of Sputnik and fears that other countries were outperforming the United States in the fields of mathematics and science. Hence, by providing appropriate funding for education, including guidance and counseling, it was thought that more students would find their way into the sciences. On the other hand guidance and counseling in Columbia was found have been prompted by the vast array of student problems - personal, academic, social, and career issues. Typically, these areas were found to be blended together when working with a student on any one topic; hence, it was impossible to separate the duties of a counselor on the basis of a particular problem.

Eadaoin (2000) carried out a study on counseling in schools in Hong Kong. The main objective of the study was to find out the role of counseling in fourth grade schools. It was noted that counseling in schools helps improve academic achievement since students help each other academically, socially and even psychologically. The study was on the importance of counseling in schools. The contribution of the study is of significance in this study based on its findings on the role of counseling in academic achievement.

A study by Schmidt (2003) on professional school counseling in the United States pointed out the necessity to implement a comprehensive school counseling programme that promotes and

enhances student achievement through a guidance curriculum, individual planning strategies, responsive services and comprehensive school counseling programme support/ advocacy. The study established that professional school counselors meet the needs of student in basic domains: academic development, career development and personal/social development knowledge, understanding counseling, coordination and collaboration. Classroom guidance lessons are designed to be preventive in nature and include self-management and self-monitoring skills.

Gilbert (1992) when comparing the school counseling profession in Kenya with other countries like the United States, counseling began as a vocational guidance movement at the beginning of the 20th century. In Kenya guidance and counseling started with the Ministry of Labour only to give vocational counseling, which is similar to the United States. The only difference is that in the US, it was a movement while in Kenya it was only a department in the ministry of education. In the United States, professional school counselors implement a comprehensive school counseling programme that promotes and enhances student achievement through a guidance curriculum, individual planning strategies, responsive services and comprehensive school counseling programme support/ advocacy.

Muriithi (2007) conducted a study on Career Guidance and Entrepreneurship Development Initiative. The study aimed at aligning career guidance in secondary schools, colleges and universities to emerging market needs. This re-alignment was set to be attained by linking functional competence to life skills. Life skills improve employee effectiveness and entrepreneurship. The study also intended to provide information on careers to teachers/counselors to guide students in selecting marketable subjects-mix and careers and

imparts life-skills that lead to fulfilling careers. This is because life skills provide the frame for applying knowledge to real-life situations. So far, the course has been piloted in four workshops attended by 120 teachers in Laikipia. The next step is to hold a workshop for head-teachers and education officers to seek their support to resource the initiative. The pilot has generated overwhelming interest among students, teachers and parents.

Knowledge Gap

A number of studies have been fielded on guidance and counseling. A survey by Modern Machine Shop (MMS) (2002) intended to examine career guidance among high school students in the US. A study on Guidance & Counseling, a case of Vidyalaya Guidance committee by Kiran (2006) intended to focus on guidance and counseling as a process of education that starts from the birth of the child. Another study by Watanabe-Muraoka, Mieko; Senzaki and Herr (2000) focused on Contribution of Career Guidance and Counseling in schools in Israel, Japan, Turkey and Hong Kong. Christie (2001) carried out a study on educational guidance and counseling in Alexandria, Egypt. Eadaoin (2000) carried out a study on counseling in schools in Hong Kong. A study by Schmidt (2003) focused on professional school counseling in the United States. Muriithi (2007) conducted a study on Career Guidance and Entrepreneurship Development Initiative. These studies laid much emphasis on the general role of guidance and counseling. Little attention has been given to the role of guidance and counseling in schools. Thus, this review intended to unveil the critical role that G&C plays towards establishment of career path.

Comment: *Bring out the key findings of the reviewed studies and show the gap.*

PART III

PEER REVIEW FEEDBACK SHEET

No	**Areas of Review**	**Comment/Remark**
1.	Review on the Topic	The topic is concise
2.	Reasons given to support the paper. Are they adequate	The reasons given to support the topic not adequate.
3.	Statement of the problem. Is the evidence adequate?	The problem is not emerging as such. The statement of problem from social need and knowledge gap should be reinforced
4.	Argument advanced by the writer. Are they sound?	To some extent, the arguments advanced are valid, but there is need to bring out the knowledge gap based on the available body of literature
5.	Fallacies in the review. Which fallacies?	There are number of errors – mainly formating
6.	Introduction and conclusion of the paper	Introduction is scanty, conclusion does not bring out clearly the gap that the study intends to fill.
7.	Suggestions on improving the paper	The paper could be improved by identifying the knowledge gap and giving more strong arguments on the role of guidance and counseling which is not limited to career guidance
8.	Areas where the paper is weak	
	a) Format (APA)	Weakest area
	b) Grammar	
	c) Sentence Structure	
	d) Spelling	
	e) Punctuation	

PART IV

ARGUMENT WORKSHEET

No	Areas of Review	Argument
1.	**Introduction** Whether an introduction include a clear thesis, definition of term terms.	The introduction part briefly gives the background of the paper. The background leads to the statement of the problem which does not adequately show the problem from social need and knowledge gap. The introduction does not provide the definition of key terms
2.	**Analysis** Whether the paper answers the major paper objectives	The literature is reviewed in general without addressing specific objectives of the paper.
3.	**Evidence** Whether the paper uses empirical evidence from related studies	The review of literate is based on empirical studies on the role of guidance and counseling in schools. Sources are rightly cited using APA style. However, the critique is not exhaustive.
4.	**Organization** Whether the paper is organized logically and coherently, with flow of ideas and connectedness	The organization of the paper appears not quite logical in terms of connecting one study and another. There are some missing links in the review. Organization of the paper based on the objectives could bring out logical flow and coherence.
5.	**Style /Presentation** Whether there are grammatical, punctuation, spelling errors, use of relevant terms etc	There are certain grammatical errors in terms of spelling, long sentence structures etc.
6.	**Format** Whether the paper cites the sources correctly, uses recommended style of writing (APA)	APA style of citation has been use effectively except in some of its provisions like margins.

PART V

THE SIGNED ARGUMENT PLANNING SHEET

Name	**Anthony M. Wanjohi**
Title of paper	**The Role of Guidance and Counseling in Career Choice**
Due Date	**February, 15th 2011**

No	**Tasks**	**Date finished**
1.	Topic Identification and drafting of the question	
2.	Thesis outline	
3.	Research and Information	
4.	Reviewing of Draft	
5.	Peer review of the Draft	
6.	Revising of the peer reviewed draft	
7	Proof reading and correcting errors Formatting, grammar, spelling and punctuation	
8	Printing and submission of final draft	

Signature _____

Date _____

REFERENCES

Christie, L. (2001). *A Guide to State Laws and Regulations on Professional School Counseling.* Alexandria, VA: American Counseling Association.

Eadaoin, K. P. (2000). Guidance as a Whole School Approach in Hong Kong: From Remediation to Student Development. *International Journal for the Advancement of Counseling,* 22:69 - 82.

Gilbert. W. C (1962). *The Counselor in a Changing World.* Washington, DC: American Personnel and Guidance Association

Gysbers, N.C., Lapen, R.T. & Jones, B.A. (2000). School Board Policies for Guidance and Counseling: A Call to Action. *Professional School Counseling,* 3:349 - 355.

Krumboltz, J.D. & Kolpin, T.G. (2002). *Education Encyclopedia: School Guidance and Counseling.* Retrieved September 10, 2010 from http://www.answers.com/topic/ school-guidance-and-counseling.

Modern Machine Shop (MMS) (2002). *Survey on Career Guidance Among High School Students.* Retrieved September 9, 2010 from http://www.mmsonline.com/columns/ survey-shows-lack-of-career-guidance-among-high-school-students.aspx

Muriithi, N. (2007). *Career Guidance and Entrepreneurship Development Initiative.* Retrieved September 10, 2010 from http://www.nmuriithi.co.ke/career_guidance.pdf

Rakesh, K. (2006). *Guidance and Counselling: Vidyalaya Guidance Committee.* Retrieved September 7, 2010 from http://www.kv3pathankot.com/gs.html

Schmidt, J.J. (2003). *Counseling in Schools: Essential services and comprehensive programmes,* Retrieved Novermber, 10 2010 from http://www.counseling.org/ cacrep/2001 standards 700.htm

Watanabe, M., Mieko, A., Senzaki, T.A. & Herr, E.L. (2001). Donald Super's Contribution to Career Guidance and Counseling in Israel, Japan, Turkey and Hong Kong. *International Journal for Educational and Vocational Guidance,* 1:99 - 106.